

THE SUN HAS THE  
LARGEST KNOWN  
CIRCULATION IN  
PADUCAH.

# The Paducah Sun.

NEARLY EVERYBODY  
IN PADUCAH  
READS THE SUN  
DO YOU?

VOI. XVI. NO. 222.

PADUCAH, KY., THURSDAY, SEPTEMBER 15, 1904.

10 CENTS PER WEEK.

## TROOPS INACTIVE MAYBE FOR MONTHS

Reported General Nickolai May  
Succeed General Kuropatkin.

Russians Accuse the Japs of Using  
the Red Cross Flag Con-  
trary to Law.

## BOTH SIDES ARE RESTING UP

London, Sept. 15.—Inactivity of the  
opposing armies of Russia and Japan  
continues and no fighting of a general  
character is reported. Information com-  
ing from an authoritative source in St.  
Petersburg is that the Russians will  
winter at Harbin, but the fact that there  
probably will be two months of good  
weather for military operations before  
extreme cold weather sets in leaves  
room for a revision of this purpose in  
the light of events that may transpire.  
The Japanese are reported to be collect-  
ing taxes and otherwise administering  
affairs in Manchuria, as though the coun-  
try were conquered territory.

JAPS EVACUATE LAO YANG.  
St. Petersburg, Sept. 15.—A Mukden  
dispatch says that according to Chinese  
advice the evacuation of Lao Yang by the  
Japanese was forced, owing to the  
fearful stench arising from the dead  
bodies. Kuroki is now going east.

## VIOLATE RED CROSS.

Chefoo, Sept. 15.—A communication  
has been received by the Russian consul  
here from Gen. Balashoff, chief of the  
Red Cross at Port Arthur, requesting  
that it be made public. The general  
charges the Japanese with gross viola-  
tion of the Red Cross. He says on Japa-  
nese dead have been found notes written  
in Russian requesting their bodies be  
buried, but when Russian burial parties  
attempted to fulfill the requests they  
were fired on. Such instances, Gen. Bal-  
ashoff adds, are numerous and the Rus-  
sians are now afraid to trust the Red  
Cross flag. He states that the Japanese  
also protect movements of their troops  
by unlawful use of the Red Cross flag.

## GEN. NICK NICKOLAI.

St. Petersburg, Sept. 15.—There are  
rumors afloat to the effect that Gen.  
Nicholas Nikolaievitch, inspector of  
cavalry, may supersede Gen. Kuropatkin  
at the front. Nikolaievitch has a great  
fighting record, made during the Turkish  
war. The reports, however, may possi-  
bly be only idle gossip.

## SIX MILES ADVANCE.

Berlin, Sept. 15.—Col. Gadeke, the war  
correspondent of the Tagblatt, tele-  
graphing to his paper from Tie Pass this  
(Wednesday) morning, says: "The Rus-  
sian army is disposed south of this point.  
The Japanese have advanced only about  
six miles north of Lao Yang."

## BURIED 3,100 RUSSIANS.

Tokio, Sept. 15.—Field Marshal Oya-  
ma reports under today's date that the  
Russian position in the direction of  
Mukden are unchanged, and adds: "We  
buried thirty-one hundred Russians at  
Lao Yang."

## STOPPED SHIP.

Algiers, Sept. 15.—The Russian war-  
ship Terek stopped the British steamer  
Treherbert near Gibraltar and exam-  
ined her papers.

## TWO DEAD SUFFOCATED IN A BURNING HOUSE.

Warren, O., Sept. 15.—The house  
of Warren Clark, a farmer, was burn-  
ed to the ground this morning. Clark  
and his son Louis suffocated, being  
unable to escape from the upper  
rooms. Five other members of the  
family escaped.

## DANGEROUS MAN

ANARCHIST ARRESTED WITH TEN  
DYNAMITE CARTRIDGES.

Madrid, Sept. 15.—The police arrested  
today a well-known and dangerous an-  
archist named Flores, who arrived in  
Madrid from Paris for the purpose of  
assassinating Premier Maura. Ten dy-  
namite cartridges and compromising doc-  
uments were found on his person.

## PADUCAH NOW HAS ELEVEN CARRIERS

Another One Has Been Ordered  
October 1st.

This Makes Five in Six Years.—Mr.  
Ebbert the New Post-  
man.

## A NEW SUBSTITUTE NOW

Postmaster F. M. Fisher today receiv-  
ed notice that the postoffice department  
had allowed Paducah another letter car-  
rier. This was good news, but was not  
unexpected.

An inspector was here recently and  
after going over the city, recommended  
another carrier, and the department has  
ordered him installed, effective October  
1st.

Mr. S. E. Ebbert, now a substitute,  
will be the new postman. His route has  
not been decided on. The object of these  
new carriers is to lighten the work of  
the other carriers, who would soon have  
more than they can do as the city ex-  
pands and grows.

The new carrier will make eleven for  
Paducah. There were only six when  
Postmaster F. M. Fisher took charge of  
the office six years ago, and he has suc-  
ceeded in getting almost one a year  
since he has been postmaster.

It has been the aim and desire of Post-  
master Fisher to give the public the  
best possible service, and the increase  
in the free delivery force shows to what  
extent he has been successful in this  
respect.

Mr. Ed. Riley has been appointed to  
fill the vacancy caused by the resigna-  
tion of Miss Hattie Clark, and J. A. Gra-  
ham will be promoted from second sub-  
stitute to succeed Mr. Riley, leaving a  
substitute mail carrier position to fill.

## BRANDED AS A FAKE

MEXICAN POLICE SAY THERE IS NO  
TRUTH IN THE STORY.

Mexico City, Sept. 15.—The police of  
the city were interviewed in regard to a  
news dispatch received here, under a  
Houston, Tex., date, which dispatch, as  
sent to this city, tells of an alleged con-  
spiracy on the part of two Spaniards,  
natives of Barcelona, to assassinate  
President Roosevelt, of the United  
States.

The dispatch stated that the police de-  
partment had advance information of  
the coming of the conspirators and had  
arranged to apprehend them upon arriv-  
al at Vera Cruz, but further states that  
the plans of the police miscarried, and  
that the alleged criminals had landed  
and disappeared.

The police officials deny positively  
that there was any truth in the report  
and stated that in view of the friendly  
relations existing between the sister re-  
publics, if advance information of the  
coming of two dangerous criminals had  
been received steps would at once have  
been taken to apprehend the men and get  
the facts.

The officials authoritatively stated  
that the system of espionage of the  
Mexican police department had reached  
a degree of proficiency that it would be  
almost impossible for them to make such  
a blunder as the alleged disappearance of  
the two criminals at Vera Cruz would  
indicate. In conclusion the official brand-  
ed the Houston story as a canard, pure  
and simple.

## BRITISH SHIP WHILE RUNNING A BLOKADE STROOK A MINE.

Chefo, September 15.—The British  
sailing vessel Lucia, supposed to be  
blockade running, struck a mine at  
Port Arthur today, and sank. Only  
one of the crew was saved.

## EIGHT DROWNED.

Wilmington, Del., September 15.—  
During a storm last night the tug  
Israel W. Durham, sunk in Delaware  
river off the mouth of Christian creek.  
Of the ten men aboard, but two were  
saved.

Of nearly 10,000 union men still un-  
employed in the Chicago stock yards,  
600 were reinstated.

A shadowless world would be a sun-  
less one.

## A BEAUTIFUL DAY FOR THE SHOOTERS

Hans Wagner the Winner of the  
First Event.

Noted Baseball Player Hit Every-  
thing—Tomorrow the Champion-  
ship Shoot Comes Off.

## ENTRIES FOR TODAY'S EVENTS

No better weather could be expect-  
ed for shooting than that provided by  
the weather man today. The day has  
been auspicious, ideal for looking over  
the barrel of a gun. The atmosphere,  
cool and healthful, enlivened the gun-  
ners. Additional shooters arrived last  
night and this morning and today's  
contest is the biggest and most suc-  
cessful ever pulled off by the local  
gun club.

Hans Wagner, of the Pittsburg ball  
team, which is playing at League  
Park this afternoon, one of the most  
celebrated baseball players in the  
world, was the central figure in the  
first event this morning. Nothing  
was too good for the diamond hero.  
The local gun club officials treated  
him, especially, to Kentucky hospi-  
tality and after the first event ap-  
pealed to him to enter the second  
event but he would not for fear that  
he might make his arm sore, which  
would be a handicap in his ball play-  
ing. Wagner distinguished himself  
in the seven live-bird event by killing  
straights. The entrance fee was \$5  
and "Hans" left the traps \$2.50 to  
the good. Wagner is a great lover of  
sport and if he did not devote all of  
his time to baseball would no doubt  
be one of the country's crack shots.

This is the third day of the tourna-  
ment. Tomorrow the Kentucky cham-  
pionship will be decided under the  
auspices of the Kentucky Trappers' League.  
Twenty-five live birds will  
be shot at and those contesting for the  
state championship must reside in the  
bounds of Kentucky. Other shooters  
may enter but they will only be con-  
stantants for the purse. The winner  
of the state championship gets a hand-  
some trophy cup, which he will retain  
until he is beaten.

Event No. 1 was at seven live birds.  
The entries were as follows: Ander-  
son, Ben Starr, Marshall, Brady, Wil-  
son, Page, Wagner, Edwards, Le-  
Compte, Quincy Ward, Clay, Spencer,  
Armstrong, Duncan, Kennedy, Moses  
Starr, Hansbro, Alexander, Lyons and  
Moner. The entrance fee was \$5.  
Those who killed straights were:  
Anderson, B. Starr, Brady, Wilson,  
Wagner, Clay, Spencer, M. Starr,  
Alexander and Moner.

At 11 o'clock the second event,  
which was a twelve live birds, started  
and was finished about 2 o'clock. At  
press time the secretary had not fin-  
ished making a list of the high guns.  
The entries were: Marshall, Brady,  
LeCompte, Duncan, Q. Ward, Clay,  
Spencer, Kennedy, B. Starr, Edwards,  
Hansbro, Moner, M. Starr, Anderson,  
Page, Wilson, Beyer, Alexander, Arm-  
strong, Prowse. The entrance fee  
was \$10.

At press time the most important  
event of the tournament was in pro-  
gress—the Paducah handicap. This  
shoot is at twenty-five live birds, the  
entrance fee being \$15. A large num-  
ber are taking part.  
Ed Brady, of Newbern, Tenn., mem-  
ber of the Paducah Gun Club, won the  
local club medal on the two first  
days' shoot at targets. He also beat  
all the professionals and captured the  
high average cup. Both of these  
trophies are handsome and Brady is  
very proud of his success. This is  
the first time in the history of the Pa-  
ducah club that such a thing has been  
done.

The shooting yesterday was again  
at 195 clay targets, and resulted in  
the following missed.  
Marshall 20; Brady, 17; Wilson,  
30; Spencer, 11; LeCompte, 35; Quincy  
Ward, 25; Clay, 43; Mendars, 44;  
Moses Starr, 26; Edwards, 51; Ben  
Starr, 18; Mercer, 31; P. C. Ward, 30;  
Armstrong, 27; G. Ward, 30; Prowse,  
44.

At Cynthia's Jake Connor was  
given a sentence of twenty-one years  
for the murder of James Robinson.  
Kindness is more convincing than  
keenness.

## LIVELY TIME

NEW YORK GETS A WATERSPOUT  
AND AN EARTHQUAKE.

New York, Sept. 15.—The heaviest  
rainstorm that visited this vicinity for  
some time descended upon New York  
last night and early this morning. The  
streets were filled with water and traf-  
fic on trolley cars and elevated trains  
was paralyzed for some time. Great  
damage to shipping is reported. Fol-  
lowing the heavy thunderstorm last  
night, severe earthquake shocks were  
felt over northern New York. In this  
city the buildings trembled.

At Cynthia's Jake Connor was  
given a sentence of twenty-one years  
for the murder of James Robinson.

Kindness is more convincing than  
keenness.

(Continued on Page Four.)

## NEW YORK SLATE CHOSEN LAST NIGHT

The Higgins Faction Controls  
Republican Convention.

Judge Parker May Yet Take the  
Stump Himself in a Short  
Time.

## GORMAN SUCCEEDS TAGGART

Saratoga, N. Y., September 15.—  
The following ticket will be chosen by  
the Higgins supporters, nominated by  
the Republican State Convention:

For Governor—Frank W. Higgins,  
of Cattaraugus.  
For Lieutenant Governor—Governor  
M. Linn Bruce, of New York.

For Secretary of State—John F.  
O'Brien, of Clinton.  
For Attorney General—Julius M.  
Mayer, of New York.

For State Treasurer—John D. Wale-  
meyer, of Erie.  
For State Engineer and Surveyor—  
Henry A. Van Alstyne, of Columbia.

For Chief Judge of the Court of  
Appeals—Edgar M. Cullen, of Kings.  
For Associate Judge of the Court of  
Appeals—William E. Werner, of Mon-  
roe.

PARKER MAY SPEAK.  
Chicago, September 15.—Judge  
Alton B. Parker may go on the plat-  
form within the next six weeks and  
respond personally to the questions  
asked by President Roosevelt in the  
latter's letter of acceptance, according  
to National Committeeman J. G.  
Johnson, of Kansas.

Mr. Johnson says that Senator Gor-  
man is to have charge of the cam-  
paign, superseding Chairman Taggart  
and Executive Chairman Sheehan.

Judge Parker will go to New York  
this week and consult with the na-  
tional committee. It is the belief of  
the members of the national com-  
mittee that he will go on the platform  
and reply to some of the queries of  
President Roosevelt. Former Presi-  
dent Cleveland and Mr. Bryan also  
will speak for Judge Parker.

## FOUR SPEECHES

HON. JOHN W. YERKES TO SPEND  
TIME IN DOUBTFUL STATES.

Washington, Sept. 15.—On invitation  
of the republican national committee  
John W. Yerkes, commissioner of inter-  
nal revenue, will make several speeches  
in doubtful states between October 5  
and 26. His itinerary has not yet been  
arranged. Mr. Yerkes will make four  
speeches in Kentucky in November in  
an endeavor to aid the cause of the re-  
publicans in the Bluegrass state.

## TO DISMANTLE

FORMAL PERMISSION GRANTED  
RUSSIAN COMMANDER.

Washington, September 15.—The  
navy department received a dispatch  
from San Francisco today stating that  
Captain Berlinsky, of the Russian  
auxiliary cruiser Lena, had formally  
asked permission to dismantle his  
ship.

## TROOPS WITHDRAWN

ALL AGAIN LOVELY BETWEEN  
NICARAGUA AND HONDURAS.

Mobile, Ala., Sept. 15.—The dispute  
between the republics of Nicaragua  
and Spanish Honduras has been ami-  
ably settled and Honduras troops  
have been withdrawn from Nicaragu-  
an territory. The central point of the  
disputed territory was Fort Dietrich,  
while the chief points of contention  
were the rights that are now enjoyed  
by the United States and Nicaraguan  
company, a Pittsburg mining syndi-  
cate, under a concession for which  
the American paid company \$100,000  
to the Nicaraguan government two  
years ago.

Great destruction is said to have re-  
sulted from the explosion of a bomb  
at the gate of an orphan asylum at  
Barcelona.

## SOLDIERS CARRIED AWAY BY BALLOON

Chicago Merchant Denies That  
He Is Ill in Paris.

Judge Parker and H. G. Davis  
Are Both in New York  
Today.

## THE MEXICAN VETERANS MEET

Vienna, Sept. 15.—A peculiar acci-  
dent happened today at the maneuvers  
at Hinkmayer, Hungary, while sixty-  
four artillery men were towing a bal-  
loon back to the barracks with ropes,  
which many wound about their bodies.

A sudden gust lifted the balloon and  
most of the men cut themselves loose,  
but eight were carried away and dash-  
ed against the rocks. One corporal was  
instantly killed, while a soldier was  
impaled on his own bayonet. He died a  
short time later, and the rest are terri-  
bly injured. The balloon vanished.

## MARSHALL FIELD NOT ILL.

Paris, Sept. 15.—Marshall Field, the  
Chicago merchant, today requested your  
correspondent to deny that he is seri-  
ously ill. The report is absolutely un-  
true. He has a cold, but is ready to  
go out as soon as the weather clears up.

## BOTH IN NEW YORK.

New York, Sept. 15.—Henry G. Davis,  
democratic vice presidential candidate,  
arrived at Hotel Astor this morning,  
and Judge Parker arrived later. The day  
will be devoted to political conferences.

## MEXICAN VETERANS.

St. Louis, Sept. 15.—The 31st annual  
reunion of Mexican war veterans open-  
ed in East St. Louis today, and will  
close Saturday at the world's fair. A  
hundred and fifty out of three hundred  
active members are present.

## WANTS IT BACK

ITALY ASKS PIERPONT MOR-  
GAN FOR MISSING COPE.

New York, Sept. 15.—The Italian  
government has asked that J. P.  
Morgan restore the sacred cope of As-  
coli, which was stolen from the ca-  
thedral there two years ago. To this  
proposition Mr. Morgan says: "I am  
not in a position to discuss the mat-  
ter."

The proposition for the recovery of  
the relic was advanced by the Italian  
ambassador in London, Sig. Pansa,  
who has communicated with the rep-  
resentative there of Mr. Morgan, re-  
citing the facts in connection with  
the theft of the cope, which was pur-  
chased by Mr. Morgan and is now on  
exhibition in the Kensington muse-  
um. He requests that arrangements  
be made for its return to Ascoli.

Before taking this action the Ital-  
ian embassy communicated with the  
curator of the Kensington museum  
and requested him to furnish the em-  
bassy with Morgan's address, which  
the curator said he was unable to give.

Mr. Morgan insists that he bought  
the cope with good American dollars,  
and that it is his property by right  
of purchase.

## TROOPS WITHDRAWN

ALL AGAIN LOVELY BETWEEN  
NICARAGUA AND HONDURAS.

Mobile, Ala., Sept. 15.—The dispute  
between the republics of Nicaragua  
and Spanish Honduras has been ami-  
ably settled and Honduras troops  
have been withdrawn from Nicaragu-  
an territory. The central point of the  
disputed territory was Fort Dietrich,  
while the chief points of contention  
were the rights that are now enjoyed  
by the United States and Nicaraguan  
company, a Pittsburg mining syndi-  
cate, under a concession for which  
the American paid company \$100,000  
to the Nicaraguan government two  
years ago.

Great destruction is said to have re-  
sulted from the explosion of a bomb  
at the gate of an orphan asylum at  
Barcelona.

## BRANCH LINES FOR TENNESSEE CENTRAL

The New Road to Branch Out  
Some.

Branches to Pembroke and North  
Christian County Coal Fields  
are Probable.

## NOTHING DEFINITE GIVEN OUT

The Tennessee Central railroad, now a  
"feeder" for the Illinois Central, intends  
to construct several branch lines within  
the next year, it is asserted on reliable  
authority.

At the present time this road is spend-  
ing anywhere from \$6,000 to \$8,000 a  
month on improvements in the way of  
enlarging its terminal facilities, ballast-  
ing its road bed and building new depots  
along its line and enlarging its yards.

Information has not yet been given  
out officially regarding the contemplated  
extensions, but it is understood that  
they will be of an extensive nature.

It is understood that the joint agency  
of the I. C. and T. C., in Hopkinsville  
will not continue a great while. It is  
said to be the purpose of the T. C. to  
cross Little river and construct a station  
and yards in the Mercer park property.

It is known definitely whether any  
of the proposed branches will be con-  
structed from Hopkinsville. Pembroke  
is anxious for a branch, and a line to  
the North Christian coal fields has been  
considered.

## THE LUCAS CASE

ARGUMENTS INVOLVING RIGHT TO  
REMOVE AUDITOR'S AGENTS  
HEARD.

Frankfort, Ky., Sept. 15.—Special  
Judge Carroll heard the arguments in  
the mandamus suit of Revenue Agent  
F. A. Lucas, of Paducah, against Audi-  
tor S. W. Hager to compel Auditor Hager  
to accept the bond of Lucas as such  
agent.

Lucas was appointed under Auditor  
Conter under the act of 1902, and claims  
under the act of his appointment that  
he was appointed for a fixed term of  
four years.

Judge J. H. Hazelrigg appeared for  
Lucas. It was argued for the auditor  
that the law fixing the term did not ap-  
ply in such a case and precedents were  
showing the removal of appointive offi-  
cers on the ground of public policy.

Judge Carroll took the case under  
submission.

## INCREASE IN ARMY.

KAISER WILL ASK THE REICH-  
STAG FOR 30,000 OR 40,000  
ADDITIONAL TROOPERS.

Berlin, September 15.—The govern-  
ment will ask the Reichstag this year  
to increase the strength of the army  
probably 30,000 or 40,000 men, so  
that part of the 100,000 young men fit  
for service, but rejected each year,  
can be trained.

The government intended to intro-  
duce a bill to this effect in 1903, but  
financial reasons caused a postpone-  
ment.

## GUATEMALAN MINISTER.

New York, Sept. 15.—Dr. Munoz,  
the Guatemalan Minister, who is now  
in this city, shortly will present his  
credentials to the president. Dr.  
Munoz, denies that fresh efforts are  
being made to start a revolution in  
his country.

## TODAY'S MARKETS.

(Furnished by Paducah Commission  
Co., 109 Broadway.)

	WHEAT	HIGH	LOW	CLOS.
Dec.	116 1/2	117 1/2	115 1/2	116 1/2
May	117 1/2	118 1/2	116 1/2	117 1/2
Dec.	52 1/2	53 1/2	51 1/2	52 1/2
May	53 1/2	54 1/2	52 1/2	53 1/2
OATS	33 1/2	34 1/2	32 1/2	33 1/2
Dec.	35 1/2	36 1/2	34 1/2	35 1/2
May	36 1/2	37 1/2	35 1/2	36 1/2
COTTON	10 5/8	10 3/4	10 1/2	10 5/8
Oct.	10 7/8	10 5/8	10 3/8	10 7/8
Dec.	10 5/8	10 3/8	10 1/8	10 5/8
May	10 3/8	10 1/8	9 7/8	10 3/8
STOCKS				
I. C.	140 1/2	141 1/2	139 1/2	140 1/2
L. & N.	123 1/2	124 1/2	121 1/2	123 1/2
U. S.	18 1/2	19 1/2	17 1/2	18 1/2
U. S. F.	6 1/2	6 3/4	6 1/4	6 1/2

## ARGUMENTS ON THE REGISTRATION LAW

The Test Case Came up at Cov-  
ington Before a Special Judge.

The Judge Was Appointed By the  
Administration, Which Had the  
Law Passed Last Winter.

## NO DECISION YET RENDERED

Covington, Ky., September 15.—  
Some puzzling questions were asked  
by W. H. Mackoy, who was appointed  
judge to hear the suit brought to test  
the constitutionality of the new regis-  
tration law, when the case came up  
for hearing in Covington. The suit  
was brought by Dr. J. D. Collins  
against County Clerk Yates, of Cov-  
ington, to enjoin him from issuing the  
registration blanks. Attorney D.  
W. Farleigh, of Louisville, made the  
opening argument and spoke of what  
great opportunities the new registra-  
tion offered for fraud, as a man could  
not vote unless he had a certificate  
from the county clerk.

"Why was the law passed?" he  
asked. "And for what purpose was  
it designed?"

"A man is no less a thief because  
he steals a man's vote," he said, "and  
a man's vote is a sacred thing. Every  
device and every subterfuge which  
seeks to destroy this right should be  
trampled under foot."

When he had finished, Judge Mac-  
koy asked him if he didn't think one  
of the main issues was whether or not  
the county clerk had the right to have  
the certificates printed, if the election  
officers could not disregard an uncon-  
stitutional act, and that he would like  
it made plain whether the plaintiff  
had the right to bring the suits unless  
he had been refused the right to vote,  
as this was not an action by the tax-  
payers to enjoin the unconstitutional  
expenditure of funds.

Attorney Farleigh replied that  
they had the right to suppose that  
the plaintiff might be refused the  
privilege of voting. Judge Mackoy  
stated that he thought these points  
should be discussed, and as there  
was no objection, he allowed the  
plaintiffs the opportunity of amend-  
ing their petition to cover this phase  
of the case.

Attorney Charles Furber for Yates,  
argued that the constitution granted  
the legislature the right to provide  
registration laws, and left the form  
of the registration to the discretion  
of the legislature. At the conclusion  
of the arguments Judge Mackoy took  
the case under submission, and will  
render a decision today or tomorrow.

Attorney Charles Furber for Yates,  
argued that the constitution granted  
the legislature the right to provide  
registration laws, and left the form  
of the registration to the discretion  
of the legislature. At the conclusion  
of the arguments Judge Mackoy took  
the case under submission, and will  
render a decision today or tomorrow.

Attorney Charles Furber for Yates,  
argued that the constitution granted  
the legislature the right to provide  
registration laws, and left the form  
of the registration to the discretion  
of the legislature. At the conclusion  
of the arguments Judge Mackoy took  
the case under submission